



Board Report

File #: 2017-0253, File Type: Contract

Agenda Number: 31.

SYSTEM SAFETY, SECURITY AND OPERATIONS COMMITTEE SEPTEMBER 21, 2017

SUBJECT: PARKING ENFORCEMENT SERVICES TRANSITION

ACTION: APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS

RECOMMENDATION

CONSIDER:

- A. AUTHORIZING the transition of parking enforcement services from Metro Transit Security and the Los Angeles Sheriff's Department (LASD) to the Parking Management unit; and
- B. AUTHORIZING the Chief Executive Officer to execute a five-year, firm fixed price Contract No. PS37647008 to SP+ Municipal Services, for parking enforcement services at Metro parking facilities serving Metro's transit system in the amount of \$4,599,446, subject to resolution of protest(s), if any.

ISSUE

Improving parking enforcement is part of Parking Management's broader set of efforts to maximize transit parking and improve customer service. In conjunction with the Parking Management Pilot Program ("Pilot Program"), consistent parking enforcement is needed to assist in managing parking demand in Metro's transit lots. Addressing non-transit use of spaces, compliance with parking regulations and proper use of facilities maximizes the space available to transit riders. Parking Management staff worked with Transit Security to develop a plan to transition parking enforcement to the Parking Management unit and has procured a contract for parking enforcement services at all Metro-operated parking facilities. The System Security and Law Enforcement Division is working together with Labor Relations to ensure compliance with the collective bargaining agreement, and the proposed actions assure that Transit Security would still perform key aspects of parking enforcement, as permitted by state law. Personnel of the contracted service and Transit Security will both be members of the Teamsters Local 911.

Staff is requesting authorization for the transition of duties of parking enforcement to Parking Management. If approved, the Parking Enforcement Program will be fully operational by winter 2018. Parking citations processing and adjudication will continue to be handled by Transit Court.

DISCUSSION

Background

Parking enforcement is currently handled by Metro Transit Security and contracted law enforcement, whose primary focus is to provide safety and security at Metro properties. This expansive purview limits their ability to properly enforce parking regulations along Metro's expanding transit system.

Transition and outsourcing of parking enforcement to non-sworn officers was introduced to the Board as one of Metro's RAM ("Risk Allocation Matrix") initiatives in January 2016. The initiative requires Board approval for its implementation.

Metro currently parks approximately four million cars a year at 87 parking facilities throughout Los Angeles County and issues approximately 5,000 parking citations per year. As the transit system continues to expand, so will the need to administer a more proactive and focused parking enforcement management program.

Parking Enforcement Transition

As part of the Supportive Transit Parking Program ("STPP") Master Plan study, Walker Parking Consultants ("Walker") conducted a parking enforcement analysis of Metro-operated parking facilities. The analysis indicates that the parking citation issuance at Metro parking facilities is lower than other comparable transit agencies. Metro issued approximately 5,000 citations (0.0013% of total cars parked) which is 90% fewer citations per space per year compared to two other sizable transit agencies. See the following table.

Comparison of Citation Issuance to Other Transit Agencies

| Agency | Number of Spaces | Parking Citations | Citations/ Space/Year | Citation Issuance Relative to Metro |
|------------------|------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Transit Agency 1 | 48,000 | 98,700 | 2.06 | 8.5 |
| Transit Agency 2 | 50,400 | 132,000 | 2.62 | 10.8 |
| Metro | 21,200 | 5,140 | 0.24 | n/a |

Source: Walker Parking Consultants, 2016

Therefore, Walker recommends that Metro utilize non-sworn officers and new innovative technology solutions to improve the performance of parking enforcement while also allowing Metro Security and contracted law enforcement to primarily focus on safety and security.

Transitioning the parking enforcement duties to the Parking Management unit will allow Metro Transit Security and contracted law enforcement to reallocate their resources to further focus on safety and security along Metro transit system. This move will also enhance safety at Metro parking facilities with additional personnel on site consistently and with dedicated staff resources.

Cost Analysis

Based on a recent coordinated parking enforcement review, four Los Angeles Sheriff Department ("LASD") officers along with three Metro support staff issued 35 parking citations in a six-hour time period. This effort covered three Metro parking facilities along the Expo Line. The labor cost of LASD

officers was over \$3,000, far in excess of the citation revenue. In contrast, by utilizing non-sworn officers with the proposed new technology solutions for the same enforcement effort, the total labor cost for issuing 35 citations at three locations would be \$40.00, as shown on the following table.

Coordinated Enforcement

| | Labor Hour Billable Rate | Labor Cost | Per Citation Labor Cost |
|---------------------|-----------------------------|-------------|----------------------------|
| MTA Security | \$ 64.04 | \$ 1,536.96 | \$ 43.91 |
| LASD | \$ 140.00 | \$ 3,360.00 | \$ 96.00 |
| Parking Enforcement | \$ 20.00 | \$ 40.00 | \$ 1.14 |

*LASD/MTA: 4 officers for 6 hour

*Proposed: 1 non-sworn officer @

*Hourly bill rate includes all labor

Through the new parking enforcement program, the estimated labor cost will result in approximately \$1.15 per citation.

Based on a comparable analysis by Walker, an estimated 25,000 parking citations would be expected to be issued per year. However, staff is planning to take a softer and customer service based approach on the parking citations issuance during the transition year, and only projects 15,000 parking citations to be issued. The average parking citation per Metro's Parking Ordinance and Fee Resolution is \$58.00 which is expected to generate approximately \$870,000 in gross parking citation revenue during year one.

A parking enforcement transition will not only eliminate jurisdiction confusion among Metro Transit Security, LASD and CHP officers, it will also consolidate parking enforcement, eliminating the cost of reimbursement to other agencies.

Parking Enforcement Program

To move forward with the transition, Parking Management held several interdepartmental meetings leading to an agreement by Metro Transit Security Management, Countywide Planning, Transit Court and Parking Management to transition parking enforcement responsibilities to the Parking Management unit. In preparation for this transition, Parking Management has assigned a parking enforcement manager to oversee this parking enforcement contract and all parking enforcement-related duties.

The Parking Enforcement Program objectives are to:

- Facilitate availability of parking spaces throughout the system to transit users.
- Ensure compliance with Metro's Parking Ordinance at Metro parking facilities.
- Support the Pilot Program.
- Increase safety and security with consistent presence.

-
- Identify and report maintenance needs.
 - Improve overall customer satisfaction with the transit system.

Parking Management has developed a parking enforcement transition program centered on contracting with a parking enforcement contractor. The contractor's services will focus on enforcing Metro's Parking Ordinance and Parking Fee Resolution (Metro Administration Code Chapter 8), adopted by the Board in September 2015, at all Metro-operated parking facilities. Features of the enforcement program include:

- *Innovative technology to support the Parking Management Pilot Program ("Pilot Program") and enforce parking regulations.* Parking enforcement vehicles will be equipped with mobile license plate recognition (LPR) cameras which are integrated with all parking payment systems available to Metro customers.
- *Reduction of enforcement operating costs by appropriately utilizing non-sworn peace officers and providing dedicated enforcement resources.*
- *Proactive approach driven by compliance data.*
- *Support for the Pilot Program and the overall STPP Master Plan findings and recommendations.*
- *Transit Court:* All citation administration and adjudication will remain with Transit Court.

Labor Relations

Labor Relations Staff is discussing the initiative with Teamster Local 911 Transit Security Management to ensure the compliance with the collective bargaining agreement. In accordance with the collective bargaining agreement, Transit Security will continue to perform key aspects of parking enforcement, only as permitted by state law, along with the contracted service provider. Metro committed to include specific language in the service contract to illustrate each party's duties. The service contractor will also be required to utilize Teamster Local 911 members to perform contracted services.

Parking Enforcement Implementation Plan

Metro Parking Management and Transit Court have developed the following inter-departmental responsibilities after the transition:

Metro Parking Management Unit Responsibilities:

- Implement new parking enforcement protocol, procedures and schedule for the new parking enforcement program.
- Enforce Metro's Parking Ordinance and Parking Fee Resolution.
- Patrol all Metro-managed parking facilities.
- Report all irregular activities to Transit Court for coordination with law enforcement and/or Metro Transit Security.
- Provide adequate materials for hearing and appeal process to Transit Court.
- Upload via the Transit ECitation Software Application all parking citation data in a citation database of Transit Court.

- Install and purchase all parking enforcement equipment and innovative solutions.
- Procure, monitor performance, audit and administer the parking enforcement contractor contract.

Metro Transit Security Responsibilities

- Enforce Metro Parking Ordinance violations not related to payment.
- Enforce all Metro adopted Administrative Codes.

LASD/LAPD/LBPD Responsibilities:

- Enforce all California Vehicle Code violations.
- Enforce ADA placard and license plate compliance and parking violations.
- Impound and towing of vehicles according to regulation.

Metro Transit Court Responsibilities:

- Process and collect parking citation fees.
- Conduct initial review of citations.
- Conduct an Administrative Hearing.
- Audit and account for the parking citation revenue collection.
- Recruit the independent reviewer and/or hearing officers and pay the costs for the review and hearing officers.
- Retention and safekeeping of the records of the appeal hearings.
- Prepare case package for citations which require further appeal process to the Superior Court and represent the Agency on appeals at Superior Court.
- Respond to customer-related citation complaints.

The Selected Contractor

Major contract tasks include:

- Enforcement of Metro Parking Ordinance and Fee Resolution.
- Report irregular activities to Metro.
- Report maintenance needs at Metro parking facilities.
- Develop a parking enforcement database available to Metro at all times.

The parking enforcement contractor will utilize the latest technology in the parking industry. Some of the parking equipment provided by the parking enforcement contractor include: vehicles, printers, cameras, parking citation issuance handhelds and mobile license plate recognition system. The parking enforcement contractor will also be able to integrate its system with Metro's current parking programs and Transit Court citation issuance applications. All equipment will be housed and maintained by the contractor.

DETERMINATION OF SAFETY IMPACT

Once implemented, the parking enforcement contractor's services will improve the safety of patrons

at Metro transit parking facilities. Parking enforcement officers will increase vigilance and a sense of safety and security at Metro parking facilities. The regular visibility of parking enforcement officers will help reduce speeding and deter illegal and unsafe activities on Metro property. Parking enforcement officers will be able to address situations and notify Transit Security more proactively. Contracted law enforcement and Metro's Transit Security will be able to reallocate their time and resources to further focus on safety and security of the transit system.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Once the program is implemented at all 87 Metro stations' parking facilities, staff anticipates the gross parking citation revenue estimated at \$6,670,000 over five years. The estimated operating cost for the duration of the five year contract is \$4,599,446. Based on an average parking citation cost of \$58.00 and 15,000 parking citations during FY18, the program will generate \$870,000 in year one for a total recovery cost of 81% of the parking enforcement contract in the current fiscal year.

Assuming parking citation issuance at Metro parking facilities reaches the anticipated 25,000 parking citations annually from year two to year five, the program will recover 100% of the parking enforcement services contract value. The remaining balance will also help to recover administration and citation processing costs by Transit Court and contribute to the RAM Initiative. The program will also eliminate the current operating losses by significantly reducing labor cost.

Impact to Budget

The contract cost is included in Parking Management unit's annual operating budget in Cost Center 3046 in FY18 under Account 50316, Project 308001 and Task 01.01 for Professional and Technical Services. This motion does not require any budget amendment. Since this is a multi-year contract, the cost center manager and Chief Planning Officer will be responsible for budgeting for future costs in future years.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

The Board may choose to maintain status quo and not authorize moving forward with the transition and award of the contract to outsource parking enforcement service. This is not recommended as Metro would then continue to utilize law enforcement and transit security resources for this task and operate without ample level of parking enforcement. The labor cost of continuing to utilize law enforcement and transit security officers for this task while fully enforcing rules and regulations will also continue to remain high with low efficiency. Not moving forward with this contract would be counter to Metro's RAM and continue operation without innovative solutions. This program is a large component of the Pilot Program and the STPP Master Plan and the examination of a long-term parking management strategy to manage Metro's parking resources.

NEXT STEPS

Upon approval by the Board, staff will execute Contract No. PS37647008 with SP+ Municipal Services in the amount of \$4,599,446 to implement the Parking Enforcement Program.

Successful transition of parking enforcement responsibilities to the Parking Management unit is expected to be completed by winter of 2018.


ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A - Procurement Summary

Attachment B - DEOD Summary

Prepared by: Frank Ching, Senior Director, Countywide Planning & Development, (213) 922-3033
Cal Hollis, SEO, Countywide Planning & Development, (213) 922-7319

Reviewed by: Therese W. McMillan, Chief Planning Officer, (213) 922-7077
Alex Wiggins, Chief System Security & Law Enforcement Officer, (213) 922-7415
Debra Avila, Chief Vendor/Contract Management Officer, (213) 418-3051



Phillip A. Washington
Chief Executive Officer

PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

METRO PARKING ENFORCEMENT SERVICES/PS37647008

| | | |
|----|--|-------------------------------------|
| 1. | Contract Number: PS37647008 | |
| 2. | Recommended Vendor: SP+ Municipal Services | |
| 3. | Type of Procurement (check one): <input type="checkbox"/> IFB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> RFP <input type="checkbox"/> RFP-A&E <input type="checkbox"/> Non-Competitive <input type="checkbox"/> Modification <input type="checkbox"/> Task Order | |
| 4. | Procurement Dates: | |
| | A. Issued: 2/10/2017 | |
| | B. Advertised/Publicized: 2/10/2017 | |
| | C. Pre-Proposal Conference: 2/22/2017 | |
| | D. Proposals Due: 3/20/2017 | |
| | E. Pre-Qualification Completed: 5/4/2017 | |
| | F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to Ethics: 5/9/2017 | |
| | G. Protest Period End Date: 9/22/2017 | |
| 5. | Solicitations Picked up/Downloaded: 33 | Bids/Proposals Received: 3 |
| 6. | Contract Administrator: Ana Rodriguez | Telephone Number: (213) 922-1076 |
| 7. | Project Manager: Frank Ching | Telephone Number: (213) 922-3033 |

A. Procurement Background

This Board Action is to approve Contract No. PS37647008 issued to provide parking enforcement services at all 87 Metro owned, leased and operated parking lots for a period of five years. Board approval of contract awards are subject to resolution of any properly submitted protest.

The RFP was issued in accordance with Metro's Acquisition Policy and the contract type is a firm fixed price.

Two amendments were issued during the solicitation phase of this RFP:

- Amendment No. 1, issued on February 14, 2017, provided clarification on the Evaluation Criteria and Submittal Requirements;
- Amendment No. 2, issued on March 2, 2017, extended the RFP due date to March 20, 2017.

A pre-proposal conference was held on February 22, 2017 and was attended by five participants representing four firms. There were 33 questions submitted and responses were released prior to the proposal due date.

A total of 33 firms downloaded the RFP and were included on the plan holders' list. A total of three proposals were received on March 20, 2017.

B. Evaluation of Proposals

A Proposal Evaluation Team (PET) consisting of staff from Metro, the City of Inglewood and the City of Pasadena was convened and conducted a comprehensive technical evaluation of the proposals received.

The proposals were evaluated based on the following evaluation criteria and weights:

| | |
|--|------------|
| • Experience and Qualifications | 20 percent |
| • Personnel Qualifications, Availability, and Capabilities | 10 percent |
| • Operation, Staffing, Customer Service, Auditing, and Reporting Plans | 20 percent |
| • Budget Plan | 10 percent |
| • Equipment and Software | 20 percent |
| • Price | 20 percent |

Several factors were considered when developing these weights, giving equal importance to the experience and qualifications, operation and staffing plans, equipment and software, and price.

From March 21, 2017 through April 6, 2017, the PET conducted its independent evaluation of the proposals received. The PET determined that all three firms were within the competitive range. The firms are listed below in alphabetical order:

1. LAZ Parking, Inc.
2. Serco, Inc.
3. SP+ Municipal Services

On April 6, 2017, the PET conducted interviews of the three firms. The firms had an opportunity to present their proposed project manager, the team's qualifications, and respond to the PET's questions. More specifically, the firms were asked to present a focused presentation with more detail on their proposed operation and staffing plan.

The final scoring, after interviews, determined SP+ Municipal Services to be the highest rated proposer.

Qualifications Summary of Firms within the Competitive Range:

SP+ Municipal Services (SP+)

SP+ Municipal Services is an operating division of SP+ Corporation with over 140 years of combined municipal parking experience. They have parking enforcement contracts in 15 states with several cities such as the City of Newport Beach, Santa Ana and Santa Monica. They have a strong local presence with multiple locations and a sizable portfolio that gives them access to a large labor pool to support all of

Metro's facilities. Moreover, SP+ has transit parking enforcement experience from Chicago Transit Authority and Regional Transit District (RTD) in Colorado. SP+'s proposed operation plan was thorough and well thought out providing Metro with a clear overview of their driving routes, staffing plan, and uniform selections. The plan and proposed team from SP+ exhibited their experience and attention to detail in their proposal and further gave a more detailed presentation of their operating plan during the interview including an interactive map of the driving routes proposed. The proposed project manager is a former law enforcement officer who has previously managed parking enforcement operations and demonstrated his knowledge and experience during the interview. The project manager projected confidence in undertaking this new program to deliver to Metro a high quality enforcement program with an emphasis in customer service. The team submitted a detailed proposal, and spoke confidently during the interview on the key aspects of this project such as adequate planning, administration, management, uniforms, communication, customer service, and most importantly, safety.

Serco, Inc. (Serco)

Serco, Inc. is a parking enforcement firm that has over 24 years of experience providing parking enforcement services for the City of San Francisco, the City of West Hollywood, and the City of Inglewood as well as other municipalities in the United States and internationally. Serco's proposal for this project included a good operation and staffing plan. However, they did not propose any coverage on the weekends, they did not include samples of monthly reports in the proposal, and the proposed project manager only had a little over 3 years of parking enforcement experience. Also, all firms were specifically requested to prepare an interview presentation focusing on additional details on their operation plan. Serco's presentation focused more on the firm's overall experience rather than the specifics of this project.

LAZ Parking, Inc. (LAZ)

LAZ Parking was founded in 1981 and currently has locations all across the United States. While they have limited local experience in parking enforcement, they have experience out of state such as the management of the City of Chicago's on-street parking meter system that includes supplemental enforcement services. The proposed operation plan lacked a strategic approach giving the impression that the proposer did not fully understand the intent of the program being implemented. All firms were asked by the PET to prepare a presentation focusing on the proposed operation plan; however LAZ Parking did not provide more detail on the operating plan but mostly presented on the firm's history and background. Also, the PET requested that the proposed project manager be present at the interview to answer questions pertaining to their experience. LAZ's project manager did not attend the interview, as they proposed one person in the written proposal but then decided to conduct a recruitment specifically for the position, should they be awarded the contract. This was a key deficiency due to the fact that this parking enforcement

program is new to Metro and the PET wanted to have the opportunity to speak to and question the proposed project managers and ascertain their experience, thoughts, and ideas for this project.

Following is a summary of the PET evaluation scores:

| 1 | Firm | Average Score | Factor Weight | Weighted Average Score | Rank |
|-----------|--|---------------|----------------|------------------------|----------|
| 2 | SP+ Municipal Services | | | | |
| 3 | Experience and Qualifications | 80.00 | 20.00% | 16.00 | |
| 4 | Personnel Qualifications, Availability, and Capabilities | 90.00 | 10.00% | 9.00 | |
| 5 | Operation, Staffing, Customer Service, Auditing, and Reporting Plans | 85.83 | 20.00% | 17.17 | |
| 6 | Budget Plan | 80.00 | 10.00% | 8.00 | |
| 7 | Equipment and Software | 90.00 | 20.00% | 18.00 | |
| 8 | Price | 100.00 | 20.00% | 20.00 | |
| 9 | Total | | 100.00% | 88.17 | 1 |
| 10 | Serco, Inc. | | | | |
| 11 | Experience and Qualifications | 86.67 | 20.00% | 17.33 | |
| 12 | Personnel Qualifications, Availability, and Capabilities | 63.33 | 10.00% | 6.33 | |
| 13 | Operation, Staffing, Customer Service, Auditing, and Reporting Plans | 83.33 | 20.00% | 16.67 | |
| 14 | Budget Plan | 80.00 | 10.00% | 8.00 | |
| 15 | Equipment and Software | 83.33 | 20.00% | 16.67 | |
| 16 | Price | 93.34 | 20.00% | 18.67 | |
| 17 | Total | | 100.00% | 83.67 | 2 |
| 18 | LAZ Parking | | | | |
| 19 | Experience and Qualifications | 63.33 | 20.00% | 12.67 | |
| 20 | Personnel Qualifications, Availability, and Capabilities | 56.67 | 10.00% | 5.67 | |
| 21 | Operation, Staffing, Customer Service, Auditing, and Reporting Plans | 64.17 | 20.00% | 12.83 | |
| 22 | Budget Plan | 66.67 | 10.00% | 6.67 | |
| 23 | Equipment and Software | 83.33 | 20.00% | 16.67 | |
| 24 | Price | 50.07 | 20.00% | 10.01 | |
| 25 | Total | | 100.00% | 64.52 | 3 |

C. Price Analysis

The recommended price has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon adequate price competition, an independent cost estimate (ICE), price analysis, technical analysis, fact finding, and negotiations.

The reason for the difference between the proposed amount and the negotiated amount is that during negotiations, Metro requested that SP+ amend their proposed operation plan to include two additional field supervisors. The proposed price increased slightly; however, the negotiated amount is still the lowest proposed price.

| | Proposer Name | Proposal Amount | Metro ICE | Negotiated amount |
|----|------------------------|------------------------|------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. | SP+ Municipal Services | \$4,408,364 | \$4,402,041 | \$4,599,446 |
| 2. | Serco, Inc. | \$4,723,075 | \$4,402,041 | |
| 3. | LAZ Parking | \$8,804,492 | \$4,402,041 | |

D. Background on Recommended Contractor

The recommended firm, SP+ Municipal Services, a division of SP+ Corporation, is located in Los Angeles, California, and has decades of parking services experience with municipalities throughout the United States. Examples of some of their local collaborations include services for the Los Angeles Department of Transportation (LADOT), Riverside, Santa Ana, and Santa Monica. Currently, SP+ is performing parking enforcement services for the City of Newport Beach, the City of Santa Ana, and the City of Vallejo in California as well as the RTD in Colorado, the Chicago Transit Authority and the Metropolitan Rail Corporation in Illinois. SP+'s proposed project manager is a former law enforcement officer with 30 years of public service experience, including five years on the executive team of the Santa Monica Police Department. In partnership with Metro, the SP+ team will enforce Metro's parking ordinances with efficiency in order to provide high quality service and ensure that Metro's parking resources are utilized primarily by Metro's transit patrons.

DEOD SUMMARY

PARKING ENFORCEMENT SERVICES / PS37647008

A. Small Business Participation

The Diversity and Economic Opportunity Department (DEOD) did not establish a Small Business Enterprise (SBE) goal for this procurement based on lack of subcontracting opportunities. According to the Project Manager, the parking enforcement and citation services include specialized training, technology, and court related requirements currently performed by the Los Angeles Sheriff's Department. These duties, as well as the low emission, fuel efficient vehicles with security levels equivalent to police vehicles, cannot be sourced by any subcontractors in the enforcement service industry.

B. Living Wage and Service Contract Worker Retention Policy Applicability

The Living Wage and Service Contract Worker Retention Policy (LW/SCWRP) is applicable to this Contract. Metro staff will monitor and enforce the policy guidelines to ensure that applicable workers are paid at minimum, the current Living Wage rate of \$16.18 per hour (\$11.27 base + \$4.91 health benefits), including yearly increases of up to 3% of the total wage. In addition, contractors will be responsible for submitting the required reports for the Living Wage and Service Contract Worker Retention Policy and other related documentation to staff to determine overall compliance with the policy.

C. Prevailing Wage Applicability

Prevailing wage is not applicable to this Contract.

D. Project Labor Agreement/Construction Careers Policy

Project Labor Agreement/Construction Careers Policy is not applicable to this Contract.

Parking Enforcement Program

Presented by:
Frank Ching
Sr. Director, Parking Management
Countywide Planning & Development
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority



Parking Enforcement Program

Current program

- Performed by Contracted Law Enforcement, Transit Security & CHP (CALTRANS)
- Coordinated effort
- Re-active complaint based response
- Availability based on allowable resource
- Safety, security & criminal activity are top priorities

Purpose of proposal

- Eliminate jurisdiction confusion
- Reallocate police and security resources to focus on safety and security
- Consolidate to one parking enforcement team throughout the system
- Increase efficiency by implementing new parking enforcement technology
- One of proposed RAM initiatives introduced to the board



Parking Enforcement Transition

– Proactive approach

- Regular visits to all parking locations, identifying possible safety concerns and reporting to the necessary departments.
- Reduce customer complaints by addressing concerns in real time with around the clock parking enforcement.
- Ensure facilities are being used for their intended purposes and space is available for Metro transit riders.



– Safety and Security

- Transitioning parking enforcement allows law enforcement and transit security to be primarily focused on safety and security rather than issuing parking tickets.



Parking Enforcement Transition

- Parking Consultant study and recommendation
 - Metro parking program parks approximately 4 million cars per year
 - 4% of violation rate parking industry standard
 - Translates to 160,000 citations annually
- Customer service oriented approach
 - 15,000 citations anticipated in year one

Comparison of Parking Citation Issuance to Other Transit Agencies

| Agency | Number of Spaces | Parking Citations | Citations/Space/Year | Citation Issuance Relative to Metro |
|------------------|------------------|-------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Transit Agency 1 | 48,000 | 98,700 | 2.06 | 8.5 |
| Transit Agency 2 | 50,400 | 132,000 | 2.62 | 10.8 |
| Metro | 21,200 | 5,140 | 0.24 | n/a |

Source: Walker Parking Consultants, 2016



New Technology

- New Technology and Efficiency
 - Mobile License Plate Recognition System
 - Integrated with Pay Stations
 - Integrated with Monthly Permit System
 - Fully Automated Verification System
 - Real-Time Communication System
 - No Equipment or Vehicle Upfront Set up or Purchase Cost
 - All equipment, software and vehicles will amortize through the contract term of 5 years.



Cost analysis

- Case study (coordinated enforcement on March 16th, 2017)
 - 4 LASD officers in six hours with three staff assistance to issue 35 citations at 4 stations (ran out of citation tickets) found 5 errors (more than 10%)
 - 24 labor hours of LASD officers, over \$3,360 in cost. Plus other assisted staffing labor cost (approximately \$950) and administration cost. With just LASD labor, cost per citation is \$96.
 - New proposed with integrated technology, two labor hours @\$20= \$40. Cost per citation, \$1.14.
 - New Innovative System will increase accuracy with automation.



Citation Issuances & Revenue Estimation, Transit Court Budget

Currently, we issue approximately 5,000 citations a year which is only 0.0013% of the Metro parking population.

- Citation Fee average is \$58.00, anticipated first \$8 to \$13 per citation from gross citation revenue collection goes to processing and administration
- 15,000 citations anticipated which is a conservative approach with a customer service oriented rollout.
- Anticipate \$750,000 to \$1,000,000 of parking citation revenue after processing and administration cost will be generate to offset the cost of the new enforcement service contract.

- All revenue will deposit to General Fund



Next Steps

- Preparation and Setup
 - Upon award and execution of a contract, begin transitioning Parking Enforcement responsibilities.
 - Integrations with Transit Court for citation upload
 - Establish admin view for Transit court adjudication in enforcement software
- Equipment
 - Purchase, mount LPR and brand vehicles
 - Integrate all payment solutions with enforcement software
- Launch
 - Full transition and launch of new Parking Enforcement team by January, 2018.

